



# National Commission on the Future of the Army

2530 Crystal Drive, Zachary Taylor Building, Suite 5000  
Arlington, VA 22202

Subject: National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) 18-19 November 2015  
Closed Meeting Unclassified Minutes

Date: 18-19 November 2015

Location: Zachary Taylor Building, Arlington VA

Format: Briefings and roundtable discussions

Attendees:

Chairman	GEN Carter F. Ham (USA, Ret)
Vice Chairman	HON Thomas Lamont (ARNGUS, Ret)
Member -	GEN James D. Thurman (USA, Ret)
Member -	GEN Larry Ellis (USA, Ret)
Member -	LTG Jack C. Stultz
Member -	HON Robert F. Hale
Member -	HON Kathleen H. Hicks
Member -	SMA Raymond Chandler (USA, Ret)
Designated Federal Officer (DFO) –	Mr. Donald Tison
Executive Director –	MG Ray Carpenter (ARNGUS, Ret)
Staff Director -	Mr. Rickey E. Smith
Other Attendees -	Kathleen Conley, Institute for Defense Analysis (IDA) BG (R) Edward Donnelly, IDA
NCFA Staff -	Mr. Jim Boatner Mr. Scott Sharp LTC Steve Pierce LTC Greg Hartvigsen LTC Edwin Rice COL Kelly Peters COL Kristen Dixon Mr. Eric Magnell Mr. Joe Eule Mr. Johnny Thomas Mr. Jason Thomas Mr. Jason Southerland Mr. Kerry Schindler LTC Tim Palmer LTC Brian Stevenson LTC Sean Spence Ms. Cherie Emerson COL Kurt Weinand MAJ Benjamin Fernandes Mr. James Eric Minton

**Subject:** National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) 18-19 November 2015  
Closed Meeting Unclassified Minutes

Documents Presented to the Commission

1. Aviation Subcommittee Report to the Commission (Classified Document stored separately)
2. Strategic Environment and Future Missions Report (Classified Document stored separately)
3. Trainee, Transient, Holdee, Student personnel account for Reserve Components, NCFA Staff Paper
4. Original Proposals Organized by Working Outline, NCFA Staff Paper
5. Final Proposals Organized by Working Outline, NCFA Staff Paper

**AGENDA**

Wednesday 18 November 2015

1300 – 1430 hours      Operational Subcommittee briefing; Commission discussion regarding force size and composition  
1430 – 1450 hours      Joint Air Defense Operations Center in the National Capital Region  
1450 – 1520 hours      Institutional Subcommittee topics  
1520 – 1600 hours      Force Generation Subcommittee Total Force Policy assessment  
1600 – 1715 hours      Aviation Subcommittee report and discussion of Aviation proposals

Thursday 19 November 2015

0800-1200 Review of final proposals  
1200-1300 Lunch  
1300-1430 Review of final proposals

**SUMMARY 18 November 2015**

The meeting was called to order at 1300 hours on 18 Nov 2015. The Chair made introductory remarks explaining the closed meeting's purpose as gaining initial agreements in principle, identifying gaps, and identifying points of contention. . The DFO discussed the meeting procedures and explained the rules regarding the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA). The discussions followed the basic agenda above with a free-flow of classified and unclassified information. Commissioners often cycled back to a discussion topic from earlier in the meeting.

Commissioners received a classified brief from the Operational Subcommittee explaining the Subcommittee's analysis of force size and composition alternatives to inform recommendations regarding size, force structure, and force mix. The results included additional modeling excursions directed by the Commission during the October 2015 Comprehensive Analytical Review. The Subcommittee described where forces were likely sufficient and insufficient to include "early deployers" (those units required for employment early in potential conflict). The Subcommittee report also presented their conclusions concerning the future strategic environment and likely missions for Army forces. Commissioners decided to include several of the detailed analysis results in the classified annex of the NCFA final report.

**Subject:** National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) 18-19 November 2015  
Closed Meeting Unclassified Minutes

Dr. Hicks provided a brief overview of her site visit to the Joint Air Defense Operations Center (JADOC) in the National Capital Region. The visit included the JADOC and one of the air defense weapons sites protecting key assets in the National Capitol Region. The JADOC's mission is to provide command and control for the North American Air Defense (NORAD) Command's ground-based, fully integrated, multi-layered air and missile defense in the National Capital Region. The JADOC commands a network of radars, missile systems, communications equipment, and cameras on 24/7 continual alert.

The Institutional Subcommittee provided a final report to the Commission on five topics: (1) legislative and policy proposals to achieve One Army Recruiting, (2) One Army School System and other unity of effort initiatives in training and Soldier development, (3) Trainee, Transient, Holdee, and Student (TTHS) personnel account for Reserve Components, (4) feasibility of merging the Active Guard and Reserve (AGR) full time support program into the Regular Army force structure, and (5) minimum size for the Army's Generating Force. Commissioners discussed how these issues and related proposals would affect readiness and force size.

The Force Generation Subcommittee provided its assessment of the Total Force Policy and whether the rate of Army unit deployments allowed a sustainable peacetime rotational rate (time deployed : time at home station) of 1:2 Regular Army and 1:5 for Army National Guard and Army Reserve. The Subcommittee reported on Army high demand units from all three Components for the period 2010 to 2014. The information identified unit types that exceeded the Secretary of Defense (SECDEF) planning guidance of 1:2 for Active Component and 1:5 for the Reserve Components. During this four year period, twenty-six (26) different types of Active Component units exceeded the SECDEF planning guidance, and fourteen (14) different types of Reserve Components units exceeded the SECDEF planning guidance (detailed unit listing classified).

The Aviation Subcommittee provided the full Commission its final report (classified). The Commissioners unanimously supported the report's conclusions and directed using the report as the basis for developing the Aviation chapter for the final NCFA report. Commissioners noted a more specific discussion of depth and scalability was as needed in the final NCFA report. Additionally, Commissioners directed the NCFA staff to research (1) aviation accident rates in recent years as a possible addition to the information provided, and (2) information on unused flight hours at the end of a fiscal year as a potential source of funds.

At 1715 hours, the meeting recessed until the next day and reconvened at 0800 hours. Using a list of potential proposals/recommendations, the Commission reviewed each proposal by discussing the evidence, merits, and expected outcomes from recommending a given proposal. The list was derived by the NCFA Staff from Subcommittee products as well as Commissioners' comments during previous open and closed meetings. The list was organized by chapter from the final report's draft outline.

The ensuing deliberations involved a free flow of information from classified and unclassified sources. The purpose of the deliberations was to gain initial consensus, identify

**Subject:** National Commission on the Future of the Army (NCFA) 18-19 November 2015  
Closed Meeting Unclassified Minutes

gaps, and identify points of contention. Commissioners categorized individual proposals as (1) move forward for drafting as an agreement in principle, (2) rejected, (3) requires revision, or (4) requires more information before a decision is possible.

The Commissioners directed the NCFA Staff provide additional research on several topics. The chapter leads, a Drafting Subcommittee member assisted by two NCFA Staff members, were directed to develop initial chapters using the proposals with agreement in principle. Subcommittee Chairs were directed to offer potential compromises for proposals from their subcommittee that required revision.

The meeting adjourned at 1430 hours on 19 November 2015.